



WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT AND CIVIL SOCIETY STRENGTHENING INITIATIVE

EVALUATION REPORT

FEDERAL REPUBLIC of NIGERIA

Submitted to

UNITED STATES AGENCY FOR INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT

By

**The Mitchell Group, Inc.
1816 11th Street N.W.
Washington, DC 20001, USA**

Team Members

**Aluisio M. da Rosa Borges, Ph.D., Team Leader
Ayele Lea. E. Adubra, Ph.D.
Aderemi Medupin, Ph.D.
Philips Olayide Okunola, Ph.D.**

October, 2002

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY.....	1
1. INTRODUCTION.....	4
1.1. DESCRIPTION OF THE PROJECT	4
1.1.1. Aims and objectives of WDCSSI.....	4
1.1.2 Key activities of WDCSSI.....	4
1.2 GOAL AND OBJECTIVES OF THE EVALUATION	5
2. METHODOLOGY	5
2.1. RAPID APPRAISAL METHODOLOGY	5
2.2. DATA COLLECTION	5
2.2.1. Document analysis	5
2.2.2. Interviews	6
2.3.3. Site visits	6
3. FINDINGS	6
3.1 THE BASELINE SURVEY	6
3.2 ASSESSMENT OF PERFORMANCE AND IMPACT OF THE PROJECT	7
3.2.1 The national secretariat	7
3.2.2. Lagos program.....	8
3.2.3. Delta program.....	10
3.2.4 Kano Program.....	11
3.3 CURRICULUM MODULES	13
3.3.1. Revision and development of vocational curricula	13
3.3.2 Life skills curricula	14
Peace education.....	14
Sexuality and HIV/AIDS	14
3.4 INSTRUCTION.....	15
3.5 QUANTITY AND QUALITY OF STAFF.....	15
3.6 INFRASTRUCTURES, EQUIPMENT AND FACILITIES	16
3.7 ROLES OF OICI/NOIC	16
3.7.1 NOIC National Boards and Regional Advisory Boards.....	16
3.7.2 OICI/NOIC Efforts at coordination with state and federal stakeholders.....	17
3.8 SUPPORT FROM OICI HEADQUARTERS.....	18
3.9 GENDER.....	19
4. LESSONS LEARNED	19
4.1 IMPACT	19
Potentials of the project	19
Infrastructure	20
OIC/NOIC management and staff.....	20
Local support	20
4.2 SUSTAINABILITY	20
4.3 SUGGESTIONS FOR THE REMAINDER OF WDCSSI.....	21
Prioritization of interventions	21
Fostering a participatory approach.....	22
Re-assignment of responsibilities for some staff.....	22
Intensification of the revision/development of curricula	22
Completion of the purchase of instructional equipment.....	23
Training for instructors.....	23
Development of job placement strategies.....	23
A more inclusive approach to micro-credit.....	23
4.4 SUGGESTIONS FOR THE FUTURE	24

APPENDIX 1: SUMMARY OF THE PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT OF WDCSSI....	26
APPENDIX 2: COMPARATIVE STUDY BETWEEN THE INTERNATIONAL FOUNDATION FOR EDUCATION SELF-HELP (IFESH) AND OICI IN DELTA	34
APPENDIX 3: LIST OF CONTACTS.....	35
APPENDIX 4: LIST OF DOCUMENTS CONSULTED.....	38
APPENDIX 5: SCOPE OF WORK OF THE EVALUATION	39
APPENDIX 6: OICI RESPONSE	50
APPENDIX 7: TMG CONSULTANTS' RESPONSE TO NOIC'S AND OICI'S FEEDBACK ON THE EVALUATION OF THE WDSSCI.....	54

Executive Summary

This report presents an evaluation of the Workforce Development and Civil Society Strengthening Initiative (WDCSSI), being implemented by Opportunities Industrialization Centers International (OICI) via its affiliate, Nigeria Opportunities Industrialization Centers (NOIC). It focuses on the activities implemented to date, provides data and makes suggestions to maximize results for the remainder of the project.

The specific objectives of this two-year USAID-funded project are (1) to increase access to training, employment and income generation activities in Kano, Lagos and Warri (Delta region), (2) to strengthen the organizational capacity and sustainability of cooperatives and NGOs working in this area, and (3) to reduce the incidence of violent individual and group conflicts in the area and improve local ability to handle conflicts non-violently.

The overall assessment shows that activities leading up to the actual implementation of the project have suffered from delays. The past 15 months have been used mostly to lay the groundwork for effective takeoff of the project. Achievement rates for most activities are behind target. This means that indicators for impact and sustainability are not clearly visible. On the other hand, after a slow start in attaining the proper staffing for the project, management at both the NOIC National Secretariat and local levels are, in general, well qualified and trained for their jobs.

Some progress has been made in areas under Objectives # 1 (training, employment, and income generation activities) and # 3 (peace/conflict resolution education):

- The upgrading and building of facilities has been completed and has proven helpful.
- The baseline survey has been completed. Though its recommendations are insufficiently concrete, overall the document is a useful basis for project planning and goal setting.
- The implementation of the HIV/AIDS and peace education (life skills) initiative is almost completed. This has included integrating these subjects into curricula, organizing other peace promotion activities and training instructors at other vocational institutes in life skills education.
- The revision or development of vocational skills curricula using the Competency-Based Education (CBE) approach has produced four out of nine curricula needed in Lagos. Kano is currently reviewing three.
- Employer advisory committees have been formed or are in the process of formation at all sites. They should prove especially valuable in providing information about the skills and skill combinations in demand in the job market.
- A number of staff, especially management, have received training in CBE principles.
- Career counseling is being provided on at least one site.

However, there is a need for further work even in the above-mentioned areas:

- NOIC's job placement rates have fallen from 67 percent to 64 percent in Lagos, and from 70 percent to 57.6 percent in Warri. According to NOIC management and staff, this is due both to employers' general reluctance to hire for economic reasons and to their lack of trust in NOIC trainees after the length of training was shortened from 18 months to 12 months.
- The HIV/AIDS curriculum needs to be revised to include both a learner's manual and a comprehensive trainer's manual addressing instructors' needs for updated information on HIV/AIDS prevention. In addition, more visual material should be developed for low-English ability learners; also, the HIV/AIDS curriculum used in socially conservative Kano should be assessed for effectiveness (sexuality education has been omitted).
- More in-depth training on the CBE approach should be organized for curriculum developers and trainers. It is especially important that CBE be used more systematically in revising and developing new curricula.
- In addressing the need to make employers partners, there should be more regular and systematic coordination between the job development effort, the development of curriculum units at each site, and the employers' advisory committees created during the employers' forums.

On the whole, Objective # 2, which targets local NGO capacity building, has not been accomplished, with two exceptions:

- One workshop was organized for local NGOs and cooperatives in Warri, with 53 participants from 39 organizations.
- The micro-credit scheme started at the end of June with disbursements to 18 cooperatives, totaling 450 women. It is too early to judge impact, but both grantees and an OICI advisor have suggested that the grants made so far are too small (c. US \$400) to be very effective.

The advisory services that Kano was to offer to NGOs and cooperatives under the same objective have not started yet.

Suggestions for the remainder of the project include:

- Prioritize interventions in order to concentrate on areas that will have impact and give indications of sustainability using a more participatory approach.
- Reduce Objective # 2 to just the micro-credit scheme in Kano. More beneficiaries have to be included in this activity, especially the graduates of vocational institutions and those from underprivileged populations.
- Intensify activities leading to Objective # 1, such as curriculum revision and/or development based on the finding of the baseline survey; getting feedback from employers on training needs and market opportunities; job placement strategies; and training of NOIC trainers in CBE methods and in recent technical advances in their fields.

Work on Objective # 3, which emphasizes life skills and getting positive interaction local stakeholders on peace issues, should be continued, with regular follow-up activities. The training of trainers for other vocational institutions, however, should be discontinued. It is too soon for NOIC trainers, who themselves are in the process of mastering new knowledge and skills, to embark on activities designed to impart those skills. This will also help to focus energy on the training at the center. There is a need to extend the duration of the project, currently scheduled to end in January 2003, in order to cover the academic year in Nigeria.

In conclusion, the delay in implementation of the WDCSSI has been detrimental to the project. However, the foundations for success exist. They include the local support represented by the NOIC's National Board of Directors and Program Advisory Committees; qualified and trained management and staff; and upgraded equipment and facilities. Self-sufficiency after USAID funding ends can be attained by putting more emphasis on income generation activities. It is essential that OICI call on the devotion and energy of all actors in this project so that the remaining months can be effectively used to achieve demonstrable impact and sustainability.

1. INTRODUCTION

This report presents an evaluation of the Workforce Development and Civil Society Strengthening Initiative (WDCSSI). The goal of this evaluation is to focus on the various activities of the project, assess its performance to date, provide input on how to best maximize results for the remainder of USAID funding (scheduled to end January 2003) and help to address issues of sustainability—particularly as regards the Kano program.

1.1. Description of the project

In January 2001, USAID/Nigeria awarded Opportunities Industrialization Centers International (OICI) a \$2.88 million cooperative agreement to implement the Workforce Development and Civil Society Strengthening Initiative (WDCSSI). OICI is implementing the project through Nigeria Opportunities Industrialization Centers (NOIC), an OICI affiliate, with the assistance of two U.S. OIC technical advisors (one based in Lagos, the other in Kano). The project is active in three states: Lagos, Delta and Kano. Approximately 50 percent of the funds are allotted to Kano, while the remainder is to be shared between the other two sites. In Lagos and Delta, the project uses NOIC training centers, whereas in Kano it works through existing federal, state and private vocational institutions and non-governmental organizations (NGOs).

1.1.1. Aims and objectives of WDCSSI

The aim of WDCSSI is to help the people and government of Nigeria address the challenges of workforce development, job creation, NGO strengthening, conflict resolution and private sector economic development. Specifically, it strives to:

- Strengthen existing vocational skills training institutions.
- Spark a dialogue between training institutions and the trade/industry sectors to assess the market and determine training needs.
- Upgrade vocational skills curricula and instruction; and
- Train individuals in basic skills (HIV/AIDS and conflict mitigation) needed to improve the quality of their lives and to strengthen civil society.

Three specific objectives were outlined at the beginning of the project are:

- To increase access to training, employment and income generation activity in Kano, Lagos and Delta;
- To strengthen the organizational capacity and sustainability of cooperatives and NGOs; and
- To reduce the incidence of violent individual and group conflicts and improve local ability to handle conflicts non-violently.

These objectives are described in terms of intermediate results (see Appendix 1). A performance measurement plan has been designed to monitor the implementation of the project.

1.1.2 Key activities of WDCSSI

The key activities designed to achieve the above objectives are:

- The upgrading and building of facilities

- The conduct of a baseline survey
- The revision and/or development of vocational skills curricula using Competency-Based Education (CBE)
- The development and implementation of HIV/AIDS awareness/prevention and peace building courses
- Job placement for graduates
- The training of trainers for other vocational schools
- Capacity-building workshops for local NGOs and cooperatives
- The organization of employers' advisory committees
- Micro-credits for cooperatives, graduates of training programs and underprivileged youth in Kano
- Advisory and lending services to NGOs and cooperatives.

The proposal includes an expressed interest in gender issues. Women are especially targeted as trainees and micro-credit beneficiaries, but also as staff in the implementation of the project.

1.2 Goal and objectives of the evaluation

The overall goal was to assess the impact of USAID/Nigeria's current investment in, and assistance to, workforce development. The main tasks of the evaluation as assigned by the SOW (Appendix 4) were to assess the performance and impact of the above-mentioned key activities; to address issues such as OICI/NOIC's roles and the sustainability of the project, especially in Kano, after USAID funding ends; and to identify corrective actions that should be taken during the remainder of WDCSSI.

2. METHODOLOGY

2.1. Rapid Appraisal Methodology

The evaluation team opted for a Rapid Appraisal Method because it falls within a continuum of informal and formal modes of data collection used to provide decision-related information in development settings. It uses both quantitative and qualitative techniques, such as analysis of secondary data found in documents and interviews. For this evaluation, the data were collected through document analysis, one-on-one and focus-group interviews, and site visits. As much as possible the interviews were held in an informal atmosphere, using a semi-structured approach. The fieldwork was conducted from June 25 to July 31, 2002.

2.2. Data collection

2.2.1. Document analysis

The documents collected are listed in Appendix 3. They fall into the following categories:

- Cooperative agreement
- OICI proposal
- Quarterly reports
- Baseline survey
- Peace studies and HIV/AIDS curricula
- Vocational skills curricula

- USAID annual reports
- Other donors' literature on vocational education in Nigeria (GTZ)

2.2.2. Interviews

The interviews were conducted with:

- four USAID officers
- 14 key OICI/NOIC staff members
- 26 trainers and trainees
- seven employers
- 11 selected members of NOIC National Board of Directors and Program Advisory Committees
- 11 partners at the local, state and federal levels
- 40 members of two women's associations.

The purpose of the interviews conducted with NOIC management and staff was to obtain data on their background and work experience as it related to their positions, and also on their perceptions of the WDCSSI. The partners mainly discussed the impact of the project. (See list of contacts in Appendix 3)

2.3.3. Site visits

The evaluation team visited the three sites, plus other institutional partners in Lagos, Warri and Kano. These were government and private schools, women's centers and women's associations funded by the micro-credit scheme in Kano, and other institutions, such as the Kano Technology Incubation Center.

3. FINDINGS

This section presents the findings as outlined in the scope of the work. It describes the major achievements and raises issues pertaining to the specific areas of the project.

3.1 The baseline survey

Francis Jegede from the University of Derby, England, conducted the baseline survey. Its purpose was to generate essential data that can be used to benchmark performance towards the objectives and intermediate results assigned to WDCSSI. As such, the study covered only the three sites where the project is being implemented. It used both quantitative (questionnaires) and qualitative (focus-group interviews) data. The fieldwork took place between August 28 and September 18, 2001. The baseline survey report was published in February 2002 and consists of two volumes: one detailing the methodology, and the second presenting the findings. It covers seven areas of research:

- Youth unemployment, employability, education and access to micro-credit
- Vocational/skills training requirements and selection criteria
- Workforce market needs
- HIV/AIDS awareness
- Conflict resolution and civil society/peace building

- NGOs and cooperative capacity building
- NOIC staff/board members' staff development needs and equipment/facilities.

During The Mitchell Group team's first week in Abuja, Dr. Jegede and a team from OICI/NOIC made two presentations on the baseline survey: one at the USAID/Abuja office, and the second for NOIC local partners (government and non-governmental agencies). The evaluation team was present for both presentations.

A review of the survey shows that although it is very comprehensive, with findings that actually exceed the scope of the project, the stated implications remain at the broad policy level. Consequently, there is an urgent need to translate these implications into specific actions. In addition, the design of the survey left out policymakers (officials of ministries and other agencies) at the state and federal levels. Their views and experiences would have helped in triangulating the findings and also in better understanding some of the issues.

The cooperative agreement stated that the study was to be conducted three months into the project. However, eight months passed before fieldwork for the study began, and it took more than a year for this essential working tool to be available for use by the project implementers. This important document should have informed the needs assessment guiding the project's rationale or, at least, served to help revise the existing curricula and guide the purchase of training equipment. The result of this delay is a loss of time and of an opportunity to ground the project in a way that would have permitted it to obtain more concrete results.

Since the end of June, Lagos and Kano have started to devise actions that will address some of the issues identified by the baseline survey. Delta has not done any formal assessment yet. There is a need, nevertheless, to publicize the results. It was found that some key actors (for instance, the National Board of Directors) had not yet seen the report at the time of our field trip (July 2002). It is imperative to garner the adhesion and collaboration of relevant stakeholders for the successful implementation of this project. Breaking the report into relevant "chunks" for the various stakeholders would help to attain this end.

3.2 Assessment of performance and impact of the project

The assessment of the performance and impact of WDCSSI will be based on the terms of the cooperative agreement and on the objectives assigned to the project. As an introduction to this section, we would like to observe that all activities leading to the full implementation of the project have suffered from delays involving the release of funds by USAID as well as the hiring of technical assistance and of new staff for the project in each state. This delay has had an adverse effect on the whole project, which was conceived with a specific timeline.

3.2.1 The national secretariat

Under the cooperative agreement, the National Secretariat was to be staffed and equipped to allow it to fully play the role of engine in this project. By the time of the evaluation, almost all the required staff had been hired. Unfortunately, in the first year of the project, the Secretariat suffered from an incomplete and undertrained staff, a factor that limited the Secretariat's effectiveness. However, the deficiencies in management identified at the beginning of the project are gradually being corrected. The management team has undergone training in the key areas

related to their responsibilities. The hiring of a monitoring and evaluation officer and arrival of the technical adviser in Lagos were important steps toward ensuring that progress is measured in a timely manner. One clear result is that the last two quarterly reports are more substantial than earlier ones. The work plan will have to be revised, though, to integrate the new changes based on the findings of the baseline survey and of this evaluation.

3.2.2. Lagos program

Objective # 1

To increase the relevance of technical skills to market in Kano, Lagos and Delta States, to increase the quantity and quality of such training, and to improve income generation opportunities.

Recruitment and training

The figures given for enrollment in the last quarter (771 students since the beginning of the project) seem to reflect a decline, when compared to the 1,000 students indicated in the cooperative agreement as the ordinary enrollment for Lagos. The management in Lagos explained this situation as a result of the shortening of the training program from 18 to 12 months. It appears that parents and trainees are now skeptical about the quality of NOIC training and are raising the issue of accreditation. In the past, NOIC's strategies to help the unskilled and disadvantaged youth of Nigeria find a source of income have not had to consider accreditation. However, the competitiveness of the Nigerian market, where employers would rather hire on the strength of a diploma recognized by the educational authorities, points to the need for accreditation of NOIC training centers. The NOIC National Secretariat and the Technology and Science Education Department in the Federal Ministry of Education are currently discussing accreditation issues, which will hopefully address the validity of the training duration as it is now.

Some staff members of the National Secretariat conducted a CBE workshop for the management and the staff of the Lagos Program. However, the instructors in vocational education have not been trained in CBE yet and the new curricula will be used for the next academic year rather than this one.

All the trainees enrolled at the Lagos Center are taught sexuality and HIV/AIDS awareness as well as peace education. Some of them are enrolled in the Peace Club, which aims to promote further awareness of peace skills.

Employers' Forums

The program held two Employers' Forums in 2002. The first had a low turnout for a big city like Lagos: only 19 employers attended. The reason given by the management of the program for such low participation was that a political event was held on the same day. The second was a little more representative, with 36 participants. The forums had some useful results: employers now serve on new professional advisory committees for the vocational trades available in the center. During the second forum, employers also filled out questionnaires on job market requirements. The analysis of their responses is being carried out and will help in assessing the requirements of each trade. However, most of the forum activities were superficial (meet and greet), not substantive. To be effective, the Employers' Forums should go beyond the stage of a

public relations event and really engage the participants in meaningful and well-planned activities leading to market-driven curricula.

Short-term skills acquisition courses

Short courses were given to various groups (youths, retired officers, church members, etc.). The topics varied from soapmaking to marketing skills. These workshops represent a valuable source of income for NOIC. Although these activities are not, strictly speaking, part of the WDCSSI, they were referred to in the cooperative agreement as a means to ensure post-USAID funding sustainability.

Job placement

The third and fourth quarterly reports give the number of graduates that have been successfully placed in Lagos: 95 out of 148 (64 percent) and 93 out of 137 (67 percent) respectively. It should be pointed out that the figures include graduates from 1999 who had already found a job before the WDCSSI came into existence. It is only when a new group comes out in December 2002 that it will be possible to assess the results of the current project's efforts to place graduates in jobs. It should also be noted that the job developer and other members of the project management talked about the difficulties of placing new graduates during the discussions held with them. The reasons they give are both employers' general reluctance to hire, due to economic reasons, and their lack of trust in the preparedness of NOIC trainees after the shortening of training from 18 months to 12 months.

Objective # 2

To strengthen the organizational capacity and sustainability of farmers' groups, producer and marketing associations and other NGOS.

NGO Capacity-building

The Lagos Program did not hold an NGO capacity-building workshop. Instead, four NGOS from Lagos working in the same areas as WDCSSI were sent to Warri to attend the workshop held there from February 18 to 22, 2002. (See discussion in the Delta Program section.)

Objective # 3

To promote the ability to handle conflicts non-violently among trainees participating in technical training programs and in their community.

In addition to Peace Education, which has been integrated into the programs in all the vocational departments at the Center, the Peace Building Unit organized other activities, such as training of trainers, the Peace Club and research on traditional methods of conflict mitigation.

The evaluation team could not see these activities at work because of end-of-year programs at the center. We believe, however, that initiatives such as the Peace Club and research on traditional methods of conflict mitigation have the potential to root Peace Education in the socio-cultural environment of the project.

3.2.3. Delta program

Objective # 1

To increase the relevance of technical skills training to market needs to increase the quality and quantity of such training, and to improve income-generation opportunities.

Recruitment and training

Since the beginning of WDCSSI, 65 Delta students have graduated. These students completed their course in December 2001, while 77 students continue in their second year under the project. Another class of 188 students is currently enrolled in their first year in the program. In sum, 253 students have been admitted into the Delta program out of a target of 442. The total enrollment is low compared to the target in the cooperative agreement. The management in the Delta Program gives the same reason for this decline as the one in Lagos.

A CBE workshop for all instructors has not been held in the Delta program. There is a compelling need for it, as a large number of staff interviewed were ignorant of the CBE concept and its application to their day-to-day activities at the Center.

Employers' Forum

The first Employers' Forum was held on April 25, 2002. It was initially scheduled for February 2002, but had to be postponed because of preparations for the NGO capacity-building workshop. The employers are now in the process of forming committees that will advise on curriculum development and on strategies to increase job placement rates. As mentioned before, there is a need to hasten implementation of effective cooperation with employers.

Job placement

According to the management in Delta, 70.5 percent and 57.6 percent of the trainees were placed in jobs during the first and second quarters of the year. It is pertinent to note that trainees from the Catering and Hotel Management Department made up the majority of those placed, followed by trainees from the Welding and Fabrication Department.

The job placement unit at the center is encountering the same problems as that in Lagos. The interview held with the Job Developer and selected members of the Employers' Forum reveals that many employers would rather take the trainees for industrial training (IT), which is unpaid, than for the regular salaried employment.

Objective # 2

To strengthen the organizational capacity and sustainability of farmers' groups, producer and marketing associations, and other NGOS.

NGO capacity-building

A capacity-building workshop, *Consolidating the Future of NGOs in Nigeria*, was held between February 18 and 22, 2002. NGOs implementing programs involving youth skills development/workforce development, peace building and conflict mitigation and HIV/AIDS awareness attended the workshop. Its aim was to impart a variety of specific skills to managers of NGOs to enhance their capacity to sustainably fulfill their organizations' missions. The

workshop was attended by 53 participants drawn from Lagos, Rivers, Akwa-Ibom and Delta States.

Judging by the composition of the groups and the variety of topics presented, there are questions as to how much depth could have been built into the workshop for effective learning. The absence of a follow-on activity, however, makes assessment difficult.

Objective # 3

To promote the ability to handle conflicts non-violently among trainees participating in technical skills program and their communities.

All 188 of the trainees enrolled in the WDCSSI Delta Program in the first and second quarters of the year are involved in Peace Studies Education. A Peace Ambassador Club, with 22 trainee members from a variety of vocational courses at the Center, began in the first quarter of the year. The objective of the club is to promote peaceful resolution of conflicts among the trainees, as well as in their communities. It is important to stress that there is a lot of work to be done in both domains. The Delta area is very sensitive to ethnic problems, and a small incident can easily degenerate into a large problem. Early this year, there was such an incident initially involving a student and a trainer, which spread to the whole center. This is why a well-designed peace education program is very valuable, as trainees have acknowledged.

During the first quarter of the year, the project's Peace Builder made initial contacts with vocational training institutions in an effort to introduce a peace education curriculum into these schools as well. Also, during the second quarter of the year, he held a series of talks, discussions and interviews on conflict mitigation methods with associations, intellectual leaders, pressure groups, women and youth organizations and, more importantly, traditional rulers in the Delta region. The unit uses role-playing, dramatic presentations, sketches and illustrations, posters, video recordings and radio/TV advertising to spread the word on peace-building initiatives and conflict mitigation.

Judging by the various activities listed above, it seems that this unit has contributed significantly towards the achievement of Objective # 3 in the WDCSSI project.

3.2.4 Kano Program

Objective #1

To increase the relevance of technical skills to market in Kano, Lagos and Delta States, to increase the quantity and quality of such training and to improve income generation opportunities.

Employers' Forum

An Employers' Forum was held at the end of February. It gave both employers and the instructors at the various vocational schools in Kano the opportunity to discuss the issues of skills and job requirements. This event is described as successful by both NOIC staff and their partners. An important result of the forum was the completion of occupation cards that will serve as basis for describing the different trade profiles for the CBE curricula.

There has not, however, been any follow-up to the event, especially in the kind of collaborative work that could lead to a better grasp of job market requirements for the development of market-driven curricula.

Career guidance and counseling unit

Two part-time counselors are in charge of providing career guidance and counseling to Sani Abacha Youth Center trainees. During the discussions, the two counselors indicated that their initial efforts were difficult because they had to face some hostility from other instructors at the training center. But the number of students coming to ask for their service is increasing, which the instructors see as a sign of success. There is a need, though, to follow up with a proper monitoring and evaluation system.

It is necessary to emphasize the precariousness of this unit. First, it is located outside the NOIC office, escaping the direct control of the program. Second, the two counselors are part-time employees, which makes it difficult to envisage an expansion of this program to other vocational institutions as the cooperative agreement stipulates. In addition, during our stay, one of counselors indicated her desire to resign and continue her studies. All the above poses a serious threat to this activity.

Job placement

In the past, the job placement rates (60 percent and 65 percent) given in the quarterly report were taken from Sani Abacha Youth Center. It is difficult to see the impact of WDCSSI from these rates because the NOIC job developer and a vocational specialist have only been working since May 2002. They are still very new in their respective positions.

Micro-credit

The only activity really under the full control of the WDCSSI is the micro-credit scheme. The Kano micro-credit scheme is composed of three programs: the Women Empowerment Program (WEP), with a budget of \$36,000, and the Graduate Credit (GRAC) and Underprivileged Youth (UPY) programs, each with \$12,000. The WEP has already started, with loans of N 46,000 (approximately \$400) each to 18 cooperatives comprising 20–25 women apiece. The micro-credit unit at NOIC is engaged in a variety of strategies to identify more beneficiaries, such as organizing women in groups and serving as marketing officers for their products.

The GRAC concentrates on the Sani Abacha Youth Center graduates, but at present, there is a disagreement between NOIC and the coordinators of the micro-credit program at the school. NOIC would like to use the services of the coordinators at the center in their loan recovery efforts. The coordinators are demanding some kind of compensation, if that should be the case. The resulting tension made it impossible for the evaluation team to visit the school to get the necessary feedback. The OICI micro-credit specialist, K. Gyan, visiting the Kano program during our field trip, was to look into the matter and suggest solutions.

The evaluation team was, nevertheless, able to visit two women's associations, which had received loans at the end of June 2002. They expressed their appreciation of the program, but also felt that the loan was too small. The micro-credit specialist sent by OICI made the same

observations, and was in the process of reviewing the lending policies when the evaluation team was in Kano.

There has been no concrete action taken in favor of the underprivileged, a group that was also designated as a target population in the WDCSSI project proposal. The cooperative agreement also stipulates that there should be a mechanism for selection, training and monitoring of groups or associations over a period of time before the loans are disbursed. There is a feeling that this mechanism has not been fully developed yet. An indication of this concern is the fact that the micro-credit coordinator and the two field officers were only hired within the last four months, and it was only last April that they received training in micro-credit from an OICI expert. The period of time between their training and the start of the disbursement phase seems too short to establish a sound mechanism, especially when one knows that these officers do not have a background in micro-credit.

Objective # 2

To strengthen the organizational capacity and sustainability of farmers' groups, producer and marketing associations, and other NGOS.

The Kano Program has not started any systematic collaboration with the target population in this objective. Some prospective clients are being identified. Training and other services identified have not begun.

Objective # 3

To promote the ability to handle conflicts non-violently among trainees participating in technical training programs and in their community.

As in Lagos and Delta, the peace builders and HIV/AIDS specialists have conducted training of trainers for instructors of other vocational schools. They are carrying out research on conflict resolution in the community. They have also published a series of articles in the local media and are designing awareness campaigns for the coming general elections in the country.

3.3 Curriculum modules

WDCSSI identifies three strategies leading to the upgrading of vocational courses:

- Revision of existing vocational courses
- Development of new vocational courses
- Development of Peace Education and HIV/AIDS courses

3.3.1. Revision and development of vocational curricula

To date, the Lagos program has revised three curricula (secretarial studies, auto mechanics and electrical installation). In addition, as a result of the baseline survey, a new curriculum in woodwork and carpentry has been designed. Kano is in the process of revising three curricula (carpentry, knitting and sewing).

A review of the completed vocational curricula shows that, although there is an attempt to take into account the changes in the job market, there is no systematic application of the CBE

approach, which the project considers the best approach to producing market-driven curricula. The secretarial studies curriculum in Lagos was designed before the workshop on CBE was given in Kano. The curriculum developers had been exposed to the new approach, but they do not have enough practice to actually use the approach on their own yet. The steps necessary for the revision and design of new curricula, even if they seem to be understood by the training teams of each site, remain at a conceptual level. In addition, there has been no systematic identification of the competencies needed for each trade. For an efficient approach, it is important to formally define as accurately as possible the ideal profile of the trainee at the end of the training.

Delta is late in starting the revision of the vocational curricula. As said earlier, there has been no work done using the baseline survey. It is imperative to start this activity.

3.3.2 Life skills curricula

Peace education

The curriculum on peace education was designed by Academic Associates PeaceWorks, an NGO which has done substantial work in peace building and conflict mitigation in Nigeria. The same organization has trained peace builders from Lagos, Warri and Kano in the use of the curriculum. The content of the curriculum is divided into 40 units/weeks of 45 minutes apiece. A trainer's manual contains a detailed description of the approach taken and a series of active learning techniques.

The curriculum includes a good balance of a conceptual analysis of conflict as well as practical exercises for the acquisition of resolution strategies/techniques. However, there is a need to include more visual materials, especially at the conceptual stage, to meet the needs of trainees with a low level of English in all the centers, especially in Kano.

Sexuality and HIV/AIDS

The design of the sexuality and HIV/AIDS curriculum was coordinated by Action Health Incorporated, another NGO. After a series of revisions, Lagos and Warri received the final draft in the first week of July.

The curriculum is composed of eight modules divided into 40 lessons. Although the content to be taught seems appropriate for its objectives, it presents both subject content and guidance on teaching techniques in the same document. This curriculum area will improve when its instructional activities are more systematic and when a separate trainer's manual is provided. Hence, at least two sets of documents need to be designed: one for the trainer with the necessary background information on sexuality, HIV/AIDS, and HIV/AIDS prevention, and one for the learners with basic, understandable information on HIV/AIDS.

NOIC/Kano has designed its own HIV/AIDS curriculum by removing the sexuality education aspect, in accordance with Muslim culture. Its message is geared more towards AIDS prevention. The approach chosen relies on visual aids to carry the message on HIV/AIDS prevention. This technique is necessary in an environment where English is not always understood. However, it is necessary to make sure that the appropriate HIV/AIDS awareness message is not diluted.

3.4 Instruction

The evaluation team has not been able to observe classes because of the end-of-year activities in the centers. But the feedback provided by trainees and instructors shows that life skills instruction represents the flagship activity of the WDCSSI project.

Concerning the upgrading of vocational curricula, the management of Lagos indicates that it is only when classes reopen that the new ones will be introduced. Delta has not formerly started any curriculum revision yet. Kano cannot guarantee any utilization of the new curricula since they must rely on other institutions' willingness to collaborate with them.

In the three states, the trainers from other vocational schools who have received training in both HIV/AIDS and peace education gave very positive feedback on their training and on the necessity to incorporate the courses into their programs. Most of the ones we interviewed indicated that the social sciences course would be the most appropriate vehicle for this integration. At present, however, all this being recent activity, it is not clear how much of the WDCSSI life curriculum these vocational institutions will be able to use. This constitutes a problem, since the life skills curriculum is a whole and taking only part of the curriculum might jeopardize the achievement of the objectives assigned to the package.

A word of caution should be made in relation to the training of trainers (TOT). The implementation of both curricula relies heavily on the training of instructors of other vocational schools. These training sessions have been conducted by NOIC trainers who have themselves just been trained, and who generally do not have enough background experience in the subjects. It is not apparent that the trainers have mastered the subject.

3.5 Quantity and quality of staff

The non-teaching staff under WDCSSI possesses a wide range of experience and professional and academic qualifications that are quite relevant to their assigned tasks and functions. In addition, most of them have benefited from on-the-job training since their hiring.

Some units, however, are understaffed. For example, in Delta, there is only one job developer and peace builder each, though the nature of their job requires making contacts with employers of labor, stakeholders, interest groups and associations, in addition to their normal teaching load. This situation will adversely affect the performance of these units.

The number of teaching staff in Delta likewise seems to be too low. An example: There is only one instructor in the computer unit, where there are 20 students. Also, the question of how the introduction of new courses dictated by the baseline survey will affect the present composition of the teaching staff has been raised. The cooperative agreement does not make allowance for the hiring of new teaching staff in Lagos.

Under the present agreement, there is no provision of training for instructors outside of instruction in the CBE approach. If they have to function in a new environment, especially that dictated by the market, a number of them will also need training to upgrade their technical skills. Some instructors in Lagos, in particular, have been employed as trainers too long to have acquired the latest skills in their fields.

3.6 Infrastructures, equipment and facilities

The cooperative agreement stated that under WDCSSI, renovation and building of adequate facilities would be conducted in Lagos and Delta. In Lagos, the new office building for the National Secretariat is completed and office equipment has been acquired for the management of the project. All the officers interviewed expressed their satisfaction with the new situation, as equipment and facilities had been the major source of problems for the Center since its inception. In addition, instructional equipment has been bought for the catering and fashion design departments. However, according to the project management, the other departments are waiting for an analysis of the baseline survey to determine the needs in their trades.

In Delta, all the departments have now acquired additional equipment. A new building complex, comprising classrooms and staff offices, is under construction and is scheduled to be completed before school reopens. It is hoped that this will ease the problem of office congestion and lack of classroom space currently being experienced at the Center. In addition, a women's group has offered to donate land for an extension of the Center. The communication system of the Center with NOIC Headquarters in Lagos and, of course, the rest of the country, has been enhanced greatly by the addition of two telephone lines. The Center has also purchased a vehicle with USAID funding, and this goes a long way in easing the persistent transportation problem, as some officers need to be out contacting employers and other partners.

In Kano, an office has been rented and equipped for NOIC operations, smoothing management of the project. At present, there is no training center, but on the persistent demand of the National Board and the Program Advisory Committee (PAC), the management of the project has successfully secured a six months' renewable lease on a women's vocational center, owned at present by the Ministry of Women Affairs and Social Development. During the discussion, it came to light that the PAC and the management in NOIC/Kano are looking for funding, and OICI has promised to help.

On the whole, there seems to be improvement as far as facilities and equipment are concerned. However, the purchase of instructional equipment has to be completed. In addition, there is still a feeling of inadequacy, especially in the case of Delta. The whole center seems too congested. Even with the new building, there is not enough space.

3.7 Roles of OICI/NOIC

3.7.1 NOIC National Boards and Regional Advisory Boards

NOIC operates through its National Board of Directors, Regional Advisory Boards (now referred to as Program Advisory Committees), the National Secretariat, and the management and staff at each location. In addition, NOIC has two other sites in Ekiti and Akwa-Ibom.

The WDCSSI project was added to a culture with 30 years of direct management by the National Board of Directors, with other projects simultaneously carried at each site. For instance, NOIC Warri runs full-fledged projects sponsored by Shell and Chevron, corporations, which may not share the same goals as OICI or USAID. Because Shell and Chevron do not have the rationales of impact and sustainability in instituting their programs, they do not have the same system of monitoring and evaluation as OICI and USAID. Some NOIC officers were not used to giving

timely and accurate reports. It is no wonder there has been frustration in getting the WDCSSI progress reports.

The implementation of the WDCSSI project brings a dilemma with it. On one hand, there is the need for the moral and social recognition—and thereby ownership—which only the National Board of Directors and Program Advisory Committees can provide locally. On the other hand, there must be a proper balance of power between those boards, the National Secretariat and the project management. OICI has made efforts to redefine roles and provide support for the managerial capacity-building of the National Secretariat with the appointment of a new National Executive Director. At present, each entity appears to understand its roles and responsibilities. However, time is needed before there is a complete change of perceptions.

It should be stressed that the case of Kano is worrisome. There is tension between the Program Advisory Committee and the technical advisor. Each side accuses the other of stepping beyond its roles and prerogatives. The Program Advisory Board provides examples of situations where they are not consulted on or invited to events, such as Employers' Forums, that have a public relations function. They also express the concern that the technical advisor makes all the decisions without reference to the program manager. The technical advisor in turn expresses his worries that the real management of the project should not be left in the hands of the PAC. He feels that their desire to be more involved hides a strategy to hire some of their own people on the project. It was difficult for the evaluation team to go deeply into the issue, because it will take more than just listening to the two sides. Only OICI officials can get to the truth of the matter. But one thing is sure: this situation is not helping the implementation of the project.

In general, during our interviews, members of the National Board as well as those of Program Advisory Committees stated their commitment to making the project work. We mentioned the fact that it appeared that, in the past, the Board members or the PAC members had overstepped their roles. They acknowledged this fact, but expressed their wish to be more informed of the intricacies involved in implementation, in order to play their role of policymakers more effectively.

3.7.2 OICI/NOIC Efforts at coordination with state and federal stakeholders

The National Secretariat of NOIC has enhanced its working relationship with the Federal Ministry of Education. This partnership will enable the Government and the supervisory agencies on vocational education to expand their appreciation of NOIC's workforce development efforts throughout Nigeria. The Federal Ministry of Education (Technology and Science Education Department) has appointed a Principal Education Officer (Mr. U. M. Ndu) as a desk officer in charge of NOIC affairs. The National Secretariat has also drafted a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) between NOIC and the Federal Ministry of Education. In view of their recognition of NOIC's role in workforce development, the Federal Ministry of Education invited the National Secretariat to attend a special ***Stakeholder/Donor Consultative Meeting on Entrepreneurship Education in Nigeria*** co-sponsored by the International Labor Organization and the Federal Ministry of Education. The meeting was held in Abuja on February 14, 2002. In addition, contacts have been made with the Education Ministry by the National Board concerning accreditation, and it appears from the evaluation team's discussions with officials of

the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Employment, Labor and Productivity that the process has started.

The Job Development and Peace Building Education Units have increased community awareness of the NOIC program in general and the WDCSSI project in particular through their various activities in job placement, peace building/conflict mitigation and HIV/AIDS education.

A wide array of local NGOs shows a keen interest in the courses given by the centers. The centers have made collaborative arrangements with secondary schools, tertiary institutions and community-based organizations to raise awareness of and build skills in peace building/conflict mitigation and HIV/AIDS education through programs like seminars, talks and workshops.

3.8 Support from OICI headquarters

Under the cooperative agreement, OICI is to provide administrative and technical support to WDCSSI. The quarterly reports and discussions with staff show that experts from the headquarters and from other OICI affiliates have worked to sustain and correct implementation efforts. For example, OICI headquarters assisted implementation of the project by addressing some of the issues related to the training of the non-teaching staff and by bringing the National Board of Directors and the management at the National Secretariat up to a level where they have a better understanding of the project. As another example, at the time of our visit in Kano, a micro-finance expert from OICI Ghana was conducting an assessment of the micro-credit scheme and helping the Kano staff better implement the program. However, at other times, NOIC management or the technical assistance team had to rely on OICI Philadelphia to resolve matters at a point when there was a need for an immediate decision, such as the conflict between the technical advisor and the PAC in Kano. The fact that the ultimate decision-makers are in Philadelphia can only mean delay in implementing decisions.

The two technical advisors have especially exercised their expertise in management and finance. Consequently, the project's structures and the functioning of the National Secretariat show improvement over that of last year when the first quarterly report was published. In Lagos, the technical advisor came up with a revised work plan budget and management administrative plan (MAP) tool right after assuming the position, which greatly facilitated the implementation of WDCSSI. The tool proved very effective in tracking program activities of the Center, which met most of the deadlines fixed for specific project activities during the first and second quarters of 2002.

In sum, the management areas that needed strengthening at the beginning of the project have been dealt with for the most part. However, most of the project—namely, the activities to be carried out in order to fully achieve the objectives—is just starting. More precisely, to achieve objective # 1, advice and supervision must be given on such matters as curriculum development, CBE, micro-credit practices and other practices in technical and vocational education. A matrix in the appendix presents the performances of WDCSSI using the intermediate results identified by the project management.

3.9 Gender

Although young women are present in large numbers in the training centers, they are most often found in traditional women's trades, such as catering and sewing. In Lagos, there is only one young woman enrolled in mechanics. Action towards recruiting more young women in the other trades, and men in "women's trades" is necessary.

The micro-credit program in Kano has focused on women's cooperatives. But not much has been done yet in terms of training these women in business capacity building. The micro-credit scheme can serve as an opportunity to develop skills acquisitions among women's cooperatives.

4. LESSONS LEARNED

This section will first address the issues of project sustainability and impact. Then, it will conclude by making recommendations for the remainder of the project and for long-term interventions in workforce development.

4.1 Impact

It is really difficult to talk about the overall impact of the project, mainly because of the delay in actual implementation and because of the lack of a sound initial assessment of the socio-cultural environment and capacity of NOIC. This needs assessment should have been conducted by OICI before the proposal. As a result of this weakness, the objectives assigned to the project are too ambitious for its two years' duration and actually exceed NOIC's capacity. In addition to the absence of assessment prior to the proposal, the baseline survey, which could have helped to quickly redefine targeted results, was also delayed. Fifteen months into the project, what can be seen concretely is progress in the renovation or construction of buildings, the acquisition of equipment, the definition of operations, the implementation of management tools and the organization of public relations events such as Employers' Forums. All these activities are necessary, since they actually lay the foundation for future productiveness, but they have taken the time that should have been devoted to more concrete activities leading to the achievements of the three objectives of the project; indeed, little was done in Lagos and Delta during the first year of the project

For instance, Objective # 1, which targets technical skills upgrading and the improvement of income-generating opportunities, needs to be tackled more systematically and consistently. It took too long to start activities under this objective. In fact, interventions leading to the achievement of this objective via curriculum revision or development have just started. The micro-credit scheme in Kano started disbursement only at the end of June 2002. Even in the case of Objective #3, where strategies such as peace education and HIV/AIDS courses are being taught and are perceived favorably by the beneficiaries, a monitoring mechanism is needed. Since the two courses target attitudinal changes, only an in-depth study can assess its impact. At present there is very little evidence to indicate the impact of the project.

Potentials of the project

For this evaluation, lacking clear indications on the impact of the project, we have tried to identify potential impacts. The existence of these potential impacts is an indication that for at least the remainder of WDCSSI, if corrective actions are taken, the project could have some effect.

Infrastructure

Despite difficulties of operation and delay in fulfilling the objectives, most of the infrastructures and human resources needed for the implementation of the project are in place. They represent clear assets to the project. In the case of Lagos and Warri, these assets will help in upgrading the vocational courses. In the case of Kano, they will aid in offering services in curriculum development, micro-credit and job placement. Serious gaps remain in needed instructional equipment, however.

OIC/NOIC management and staff

As discussed, local management staffers are well qualified and have undergone further training that has augmented their ability to implement the project. They seem committed, and with the support of OICI technical assistance, have been instrumental in the parts of the project implemented so far.

The National Board of Directors and Program Advisory Committees are also composed of committed members. They have strived for a number of years now to inculcate a culture of self-reliance and achievement in the organization, even if it is on a small scale.

Local support

Through its 30 years of existence, NOIC has gained some recognition in the field of vocational education. It has been and still is a partner to other governmental agencies, such as the National Directorate of Employment (NDE) and the National Poverty Eradication Program (NAPEP), carrying out training programs for them. Other institutions such as Chevron and Shell have also used their services. NOIC has provided short-term training to other non-governmental organizations at different levels of their local community. WDCSSI has succeeded in starting up a network of support made up of employers and other vocational institution authorities. All these are potential supporters that will help in maximizing results.

Having acknowledged the existence of potential impacts on the ground, it remains difficult to envisage how six months will be enough time to achieve the objectives and results as stated in the cooperative agreement. For that to happen, OICI/NOIC management and staff need to define more realistic performance indicators for the project.

4.2 Sustainability

Here again, to talk about the degree of sustainability of the project seems premature. But, we can make some inferences from the present state of the mechanisms to ensure sustainability in a project—mechanisms that have been improved via capacity building and that can lead to self-sufficiency and ownership. By capacity building, we mean efforts made to upgrade not only facilities and equipment, or to develop human resources through training, but also to generate income. At present, the first two aspects of capacity-building efforts exist in the WDCSSI. However, there is a need to maximize these gains. Furthermore, income-generating activities to sustain the project as described in the cooperative agreement have not really started yet. Except for a few short-term acquisition courses in soap-making and marketing skills given in Lagos and Delta, the project does little to generate income. Kano was to offer capacity-building services to organizations that will pay, but nothing has yet been done in this respect.

The question of ownership is more sensitive but also more crucial. It can only be gained by using a participatory approach in the project. This entails a sharing of the vision and mission of WDCSSI on the part of almost all the actors in the implementation. It means that from OICI/NOIC management and staff to the instructors in the classroom, there must be a transparency about the goals and objectives of the project. At the moment, it seems that the National Board of Directorate and the National Secretariat have some understanding of the goals and objectives of the project, but the other actors need to understand and integrate the objectives into their organizations and institutions as well so that they can work towards the expected outcomes.

Kano represents a special case, and it would be unfair to compare the approach taken there to that of Lagos and Warri. In Kano, there is no training center under the direct supervision of NOIC. This makes the issue of sustainability very difficult. In addition, a lot of time has been spent starting an office and negotiating with vocational schools and other institutions for the implementation of the various programs. The micro-credit scheme has just begun and there is no concrete indication as to its success, which will be determined by the number of beneficiaries, the use the loans are put to and their recovery rate.

4.3 Suggestions for the remainder of WDCSSI

In order to foster sustainability, which is a vital goal for a development project such as WDCSSI, we would like to make two types of recommendations: for the remainder of the project and for the longer term.

Prioritization of interventions

Interventions need to be prioritized so that more time is devoted to achieving objective # 1. Activities such as revision or development of new curricula, job placement, short-term skills acquisition courses and the procurement of the remaining instructional equipment should be given priority.

We would like to stress once again the need for the management of the project, together with all the actors, to target more realistic goals. Once the baseline survey results are analyzed, a better appreciation of attainable indicators can be made. This is urgent. OICI should make sure that each center carries out working sessions on the implications of the baseline survey. Short and long-term actions should be identified at each level of the center, from management to the instructor in the classroom. Subsequently, new workplans for each center should be designed.

OICI also needs to address the implications of the baseline survey findings on the innovative character of the NOIC centers. There are a number of other vocational training centers in the three states where WDCSSI is being implemented, many with longer training durations and, for the most part, with the necessary accreditation from the Ministry of Education. The National Secretariat and the local management should start thinking of areas where WDCSSI has a comparative advantage in the vocational education arena. This should be by introducing new courses and also new training approaches. The latter has started with the life skills courses and small enterprise education. The officers of the Ministry of Education we interviewed seem to appreciate the work done by NOIC in these two areas.

Objective # 2, which targets building capacity in local NGOs, should be discontinued for the remainder of the project, except for the micro-credit scheme. Although the rationale behind this objective is job creation and civil society strengthening, both of which are important aspects of workforce development, the few months left will not be enough to yield indicators to assess the efforts put into its achievement.

Objective #3, involving the training of trainers of other vocational institutions, should also be discontinued. It is too soon for NOIC trainers, who themselves are in the process of mastering the new knowledge and skills, to embark on activities designed to impart those new skills to other trainers. This will also help in focusing energy on the training at the center.

Fostering a participatory approach

OICI, the real implementer of WDCSSI, should continue its effort to make sure that the National Board, the Program Advisory Committees, program managers and the technical advisors all keep to their roles and responsibilities in the project. All these entities are necessary for its smooth running. Tension and frustration among them will only cause delay. Transparency and collaboration will help in making sound decisions for the attainment of objectives. OICI/NOIC should conduct information sessions for all the staff members. The baseline survey findings should be discussed in groups.

Re-assignment of responsibilities for some staff

In the three programs, some units are understaffed, while others do not have enough activities to keep the staff busy on a regular basis. There is a need to re-assign responsibilities among the current management team in order to work for the achievement of the newly defined priorities. For example, in Lagos, the manpower developer, the curriculum developer at the National Secretariat and the job developer of the Lagos Program could work together, possibly under the same unit, and collaborate on job development issues. In Kano and Warri, the job developer and the curriculum developer/vocational specialist could do the same. This re-deployment will suffice to streamline human resource use.

Under WDCSSI, new trades will be introduced. Only when the centers decide on which courses to introduce (or eliminate) and with which curriculum contents will there be a clear indication on the appropriateness of the quality and number of the current teaching staff.

Intensification of the revision/development of curricula

The revision and/or development of the vocational curricula should be intensified. This activity should be dictated above all by demands of the market, but also by the profile of the trainees at entry level. A clear output profile indicating the knowledge necessary for a trainee should be defined for each trade. From this output profile, competencies can be identified and measured. Then, the objectives of each course would be taught in relation to a particular trade. The Employers' Forums have helped start the process of helping professionals to analyze job market needs. The different committees need to contribute their input for task or job analysis, the first steps to CBE.

Completion of the purchase of instructional equipment

Once the decision is made on what trades to focus on and upgrade in the curriculum, based on the baseline survey, Lagos and Warri should buy the appropriate equipment as quickly as possible. To buy the equipment, it will be necessary to consult with the heads of the departments concerned, who will know what is needed.

A budget for consumables is also needed. If the present budget cannot cover all the needs, it will be necessary to ask for participation from the trainees. We understand from our discussions with instructors that trainees are willing to contribute towards the cost of consumables.

Training for instructors

As discussed earlier, most of the instructors have not been trained in CBE. Conducting in-depth, in-house training for them and the heads of departments is essential to the success of the project. In some cases, as previously noted, instructors of vocational education also need to update their own technical skills.

Development of job placement strategies

It is evident that training alone cannot solve unemployment if, after the training, there is no job. Despite the difficult economic environment in Nigeria, there are a few jobs that are available. It is important for the job placement unit in each center to develop strategies to involve employers beyond their presence at forums, so that they constitute partners in job placement. Future forums should tackle priority job placement issues. The job placement units also should function as a job center, advertising their services to both employees and employers.

In Kano, there is a particular need to intensify the relationship with the other vocational schools in addition to Sani Abacha Youth Center, as stipulated in the cooperative agreement.

A more inclusive approach to micro-credit

Kano needs to diversify the pool of graduates and potential beneficiaries of the micro-credit plan, so as not to rely solely on Sani Abacha Youth Center. With regard to the recent problems involving the coordinators of the above-mentioned Center, it would not be fair to make them part of the loan recovery efforts. This should be the NOIC micro-credit unit's sole responsibility.

Moreover, the micro-credit scheme in Kano should begin identifying the underprivileged, a population which was specified as a target in the original proposal. In Kano, these underprivileged youths, some of them street beggars, are exploited during times of social unrest to cause damage. A very small program could serve as a test for a larger project in the future.

The micro-credit unit also needs to be more rigorous in reviewing business plans before disbursement. To make the whole program more effective, the micro-credit unit and the management of WDCSSI will need learn from OICI and UNDP MicroStart best practices, as identified by the original program; this is also USAID policy as outlined in ADS 219. The micro-credit unit officers need more in-depth training, as most of them do not have a micro-financing background.

4.4 Suggestions for the future

The WDCSSI project originated in an effort to help address the issue of youth unemployment in Nigeria. The situational analysis, which is part of the scope of work of this assignment, indicates the need for other actions to accompany vocational training in Nigeria. If WDCSSI is to be extended, it should incorporate these new strategies, which call for more emphasis on job placement, micro-financing for self-employment, and other interventions, such as technology and business incubation centers.

As far as the project in its present form is concerned, because its main components are based in a vocational system, it is advisable for USAID to extend the duration of the project to the end of the 2003 academic year. At that time, another evaluation should be carried out to determine the real impact of the project. Decisions could then be made about its extension for a longer period or on a possible change in the approach, with more emphasis on job placement and self-employment

But even before that evaluation, it is necessary to start considering other options for youth workforce development initiatives in Nigeria. These options go beyond WDCSSI. The situational analysis on youth workforce development in Nigeria details some of these options.

Appendices

Appendix 1: Summary of the performance assessment of WDCSSI

WDCSSI OBJECTIVE # 1: *To increase the relevance of technical skills training to market needs to increase the quality and quantity of such training, and to improve income-generation opportunities.*

IR: *Coordination among training organizations, employers and government offices will have increased so that training institutions can provide higher quality programming and fuller support.*

Indicator	Means of assessment	Status as of July 20, 2002	Comments
1.1.1 Advisory groups exist to determine job markets needs for each NOIC	Quarterly reports, discussions with management and staff	Employers' Forums held in Lagos, Delta and Kano. Questionnaires filled by employers being analyzed in Lagos. Lagos and Delta constituted advisory groups. Kano has started a database with occupation cards.	Data provided has not been completely analyzed yet. There is no database. Advisory committees have to meet on a regular basis.
1.1.2 Technical training courses to suit job markets or community needs operate	Quarterly reports, discussions with management and staff	Lagos program: work sessions on the baseline survey. Review of 3 out of the existing 8 vocational courses in Lagos. Development of a new one. Delta: no revision of courses yet. Kano: the revision of 3 courses has started but not completed yet.	There should be more work sessions on the baseline survey to determine which curricula should be reviewed or developed, which one should be phased out. Competency based education (CBE) should be used to review or develop courses.

Indicator	Means of assessment	Status as of July 20, 2002	Comments
1.1.3 7,500 students a 2-year target for Kano	Quarterly reports, discussions with management and staff	Not available.	There is no way to make sure that the trainers who were “sensitized” in competency-based education (CBE) have integrated the approach in their teaching.
1.1.3 At least 2,350 students served through NOIC Delta and Lagos programs	Quarterly reports, discussions with management and staff	Approximately 1,000 students have been served over the past 15 months.	The figure includes graduates who benefited for only one semester. It will take one more batch to assess the exact figure.
1.1.4 In-service training of trainers (TOT) will be operational in methodology and employment services	Quarterly reports, discussions with NOIC management and staff and selected vocational schools	Sensitization CBE workshops conducted in Kano, Lagos and Delta; career guidance and counseling established in Sani Abacha Youth Center.	There should be in-depth training workshops so that trainers really master the methodology.
1.1.5 At least 70 percent of graduates will be employed within 6 months of completing the training	Quarterly reports, discussions with NOIC management and staff	Past placement rates: Lagos 67 percent and 64 percent. Delta 70 percent , 57.6 percent. Kano (Abacha): 60-65 percent.*	The job placement rate has dropped, as acknowledged by the WDCSSI management, due to employers’ concerns about the economy and about the shortening of the training period for WDCSSI courses.

*Note: The NOIC Job Developer was only hired in May 2002, so this figure is not indicative of his performance.

IR 2: Technical skills courses will have been revised to reflect specific job tasks required by the market and technical skills; training instructors will have been trained in CBE methodology

Indicator	Means of assessment	Status as of July 20, 2002	Comments
1.2.1 Job market survey and job task analysis conducted.	Quarterly reports, discussions with NOIC management and staff.	Baseline survey completed February, 2002. Work sessions on survey finding started in Lagos and Kano.	There is a need to break the implications of the findings into concrete action plans for each site.
1.2.2. Baseline studies completed to determine skills needed.	Baseline survey report	Report published.	There is a need to break the implications of the findings into concrete action plans for each site.
1.2.3 200 instructors trained in CBE	Quarterly reports, discussions with NOIC management and staff and selected vocational schools	Sensitization of 180 instructors of vocational schools and some instructors in Lagos and Delta.	Need for more in-depth training.

IR 3: Access to credit technology and business advisory services will have increased for the economically disadvantaged

Indicator	Means of assessment	Status as of July 20, 2002	Comments
1.3.1 Twenty staff of Kano training institutions trained in micro -credit and/or small business development	Quarterly reports, discussions with NOIC management and staff and selected vocational schools	Yet to be implemented.	
1.3.1 600 vocational graduates received credit in Kano and/or tools and or business advisory services	Quarterly reports, discussions with NOIC management and staff	Guidelines on micro-credit policy developed. No loans given out yet.	

. Indicator	Means of assessment	Status as of July 20, 2002	Comments
1.3.4. A computerized job databank will exist in Kano	Quarterly reports, discussions with NOIC management and staff	List of training institutions and employees exist but not a job bank.	There is a need for funding and support, as this activity is not provided for in proposal.

WDCSSI OBJECTIVE # 2: *To strengthen the organizational capacity and sustainability of farmers' groups, producer and marketing associations, and other NGOs.*

IR 1: *Management skills planning, bookkeeping and record-keeping skills of the leaders and members of cooperatives, associations and other NGO will have increased.*

Indicator	Means of assessment	Status as of July 20, 2002	Comments
2.1.1 Two NGO capacity-building workshops in Delta and one in Kano, totaling 75 participating NGOs	Quarterly reports, discussions with NOIC management and staff	One workshop conducted in Delta for 53 participants.	Need to discontinue this activity for the remainder of WDCSSI
2.1.2. Training of 2 co-op trainers to train 25 small co-ops in Kano	Quarterly reports, discussions with NOIC management and staff	Yet to be implemented.	Need to discontinue this activity for the remainder of WDCSSI
2.1.3 1,200 micro-credit beneficiaries by end of Year 2	Quarterly reports, discussions with NOIC management and staff	Approximately 450 beneficiaries.	This represents less than 50 percent of target
2.1.4 Additional training for 150 managers of co-ops in Kano	Quarterly reports, discussions with NOIC management and staff	Yet to be implemented.	
2.1.5 Follow-up services provided to 900 members of	Quarterly reports, discussions with	Yet to be implemented.	

Indicator	Means of assessment	Status as of July 20, 2002	Comments
Kano co-ops	NOIC management and staff.		
2.1.6 Nine hundred members have benefited from specialized training in micro-credit	Quarterly reports, discussions with NOIC management and staff.	Yet to be implemented	
2.1.7 Fifty members of NOIC board of Advisory Committees and managers and staff trained in management skills	Quarterly reports, discussions with NOIC management, staff, National Board and PAC	Training mainly for staff and managers. National Board has also received training.	

IR 2: Access to resources and markets by local NGOs will have increased.

Indicator	Means of assessment	Status as of July 20, 2002	Comments
2.2.1. At least 50 percent of co-ops benefiting from training report increased access to resources (other credit funds, agribusiness inputs)	Quarterly reports, discussions with NOIC management and staff	Lending services started in June.	Although saving is encouraged with a micro-credit scheme and procedures are in place to work with a bank, no data are available for this indicator yet.
2.2.2. At least 30 percent of co-ops benefiting from training report increased access to markets	Quarterly reports, discussions with NOIC management and staff and selected beneficiaries	Lending services started in June.	There is a need to conduct a follow-up study to obtain data on this indicator.
2.2.3. At least 70 percent of NGOs training recipients report increased access to	Quarterly reports, discussions with NOIC management	Lending services started in June.	There is a need to conduct a follow-up study to obtain data on this indicator.

Indicator	Means of assessment	Status as of July 20, 2002	Comments
resources	and staff and selected beneficiaries		

IR 3: NGO services to the public will have increased and farmers' group and producer and marketing associations will have increased their profits.

Indicator	Means of assessment	Status as of July 20, 2002	Comments
2.3.1 At least 50 percent of NGOs training beneficiaries will expand programs by 30 percent after one year	Quarterly reports, discussions with NOIC management and staff and selected beneficiaries	No data available. One NGO capacity-building training held in Warri in February.	Too early to assess impact.
2.3.2. At least 30 percent of the co-ops benefiting from NOIC training will report 30 percent increased income	Quarterly reports, discussions with NOIC management and staff and selected beneficiaries	No data available. One NGO capacity-building training held in Warri in February.	Too early to assess impact.

WDCSSI OBJECTIVE # 3: *To promote the ability to handle conflicts non-violently among trainees participating in technical skills program and their communities.*

IR 1: Disputes will be managed and resolved more often and more effectively through dialogues, organization and compromise.

Indicator	Means of assessment	Status as of July 20, 2002	Comments
3.1.1 NOIC Lagos, Kano and Delta programs will have incorporated HIV/AIDS awareness training into the life skills curricula of 25 vocational schools	Quarterly reports, discussions with NOIC management and staff and selected vocational schools	HIV/AIDS awareness curriculum produced. HIV/AIDS course taught in Delta, Lagos and Warri programs. Other vocational schools trainers trained (TOT).	It is unclear how many of these other vocational schools will actually implement the new course. Data will be available next academic year.
3.1.2 Lagos, Kano and Delta programs will have incorporated peace-building training into the life-skills curricula of 25 vocational schools	Quarterly reports, discussions with NOIC management and staff and selected vocational schools	Peace education curriculum produced. Course taught in Delta, Lagos and Warri Programs. Other vocational schools trainers trained (TOT).	It is unclear how many of these other vocational schools will actually implement the new course. Data will be available next academic year.
3.1.3. Peace Builders will research traditional conflict resolution methods and collaborate with traditional rulers	Quarterly reports and discussions with Peace Builders	Delta and Warri have started.	
3.1.4. Managers and staff of NOIC will increase capacity to manage conflict non-violently	No data available	No data available.	

IR 2: Public awareness, knowledge and skills will have increased regarding how to handle disputes and resolve conflicts non-violently while attending to issues of social and economic justice.

Indicator	MEANS OF ASSESSMENT	Status as of July 20, 2002	Comments
3.2.1 Three public information seminars (one per center) on peace building delivered by May 1, 2002	Quarterly reports and discussions with Peace Builders	Articles have been written and published in Lagos, Warri and Kano, but no public seminar has been held yet. Warri is planning one.	
3.2.2. Production and distribution of 1,500 practical guides to conflict resolution	Quarterly reports and discussions with Peace Builders	Yet to be implemented.	

Appendix 2: Comparative Study between The International Foundation for Education Self-Help (IFESH) and OICI in Delta

The evaluation team was not able to interview the Country Director of IFESH. The following information has been gathered through an interview with the Western Niger Delta Development Project (WDNPP) Program Director, Mr. Amuno, and documents sent by IFESH.

	WDNPP	OICI
Duration of program	5 years (target: 500 students)	2 years (target: 442 students)
Population	Unemployed disadvantaged youth selected from communities where Chevron is drilling for oil	No specific location identified. Ordinary students found elsewhere
Activities	Training in computer and secretarial studies, welding and fabrication, tailoring and fashion, hotel catering, electronics, and marine biology	Training in computer and secretarial studies, welding and fabrication, tailoring and fashion, hotel catering, and electronics
Source of funding	Chevron Nigeria Ltd	USAID

Appendix 3: List of Contacts

Name	Position	Department	Location
Gwen El Sawi	Youth Development Specialist	Human Capacity Development Center	Washington, D.C.
Jeffrey Gray	Vice President, Employment and Training	OIC International	Philadelphia
Denis Hines	Director of Workforce Development	OIC International	Philadelphia
Bob McClusky	Youth Development Specialist	Human Capacity Development Center /USAID	Washington, D.C.
Jim Hoxeng	Project Coordinator	USAID/Washington	
Melinda Taylor	Basic Education Specialist	USAID/Nigeria	Abuja
Sandy Ojikutu	Education Advisor	USAID/Nigeria	Abuja
Konouga S. Bukar	Assistant Director	Ministry of Labour, Employment and Productivity	Abuja
Matthew U. Ndu	Technology and Science Education Department	Ministry of Education Federal Secretariat	Abuja
Celestine Okoye	Technology and Science Education Department	Ministry of Education Federal Secretariat	Abuja
Judi Burdin Asuni	Executive Director	Academic Associates PeaceWorks	Abuja
Umar Bindir	Director of Monitoring	National Poverty Eradication Program	Abuja
S. Ogunsanya	Acting National Executive Director	National Secretariat NOIC	Lagos
M.O. Alabi	Monitoring and Evaluation Officer	National Secretariat NOIC	Lagos
Jacqueline Hardware	Technical Advisor	Lagos Program	Lagos
R.S. Bankole	Manpower Development Officer	National Secretariat NOIC	Lagos
L.U. Nwosu	Curriculum Development Officer	National Secretariat NOIC	Lagos
V.E. Odia	National Chairperson	National Board of Directors	Lagos
Rev. N.G. Ogbemi	National Vice-Chairman	National Board of Directors	Lagos
E.O. Martins	National Treasurer	National Board of Directors	Lagos
Prince A.O. Adebajo	National Member	National Board of Directors	
K.A. Abiola	Program Manager	Lagos Program	Lagos
C.D. Ubochi	Training Manager	Lagos Program	Lagos
T.A. Bello	Head of Computer department	Lagos Program	Lagos
A.O. Akinniyi	Head of Secretariat Studies Department	Lagos Program	Lagos
A.O. Abiona	Zonal Director	Delta	Warri
A.O. Ejumudo	Program Manager	Delta Program	Warri

Dr. J. Amuno	Training Coordinator	WNDDP	Warri
K. O. Akeni	Peace Builder	Delta Program	Warri
S.U. Atakpo	Job Developer	Delta Program	Warri
E. R Idiodo	Counselor	Delta Program	Warri
A. Mukuro	Small Enterprise Education Instructor	Delta Program	Warri
E. Okhira	Catering Instructor	Delta Program	Warri
N. Okosobo	Computer Instructor	Delta Program	Warri
O. Adogbeji	Welding Instructor	Delta Program	Warri
N. Adidi	Trainee/ Computer Secretariat Studies	Delta Program	Warri
A. Danibla	Trainee/ Computer Secretariat	Delta Program	Warri
J. Erikowa	Trainee/ Electronics	Delta Program	Warri
E. Ijeje	Trainee/Welding & Fabrication	Delta Program	Warri
J. Iruero	Trainee/ Catering	Delta Program	Warri
G. Ogagarojoh	Trainee/ Electronics	Delta Program	Warri
E. Uzuezo	Trainee/Fashion	Delta Program	Warri
A. Young-Green	Trainee/ Catering	Delta Program	Warri
Evang E. E. Erukaye	Chairman/ Program Advisory Committee	Delta Program	Warri
B. Enaregha	Treasurer/ Program Advisory Committee	Delta Program	Warri
A. Udi	Chairman/ Employers' Forum	Dee Knowledge Steel LTD	Warri
M. Imakhu	Employers' Forum	Sam Seeli Hotel	Warri
M. Akoreh	Employers' Forum	Ishaka Hotel	Warri
Souleyman Adam	Program Director	NOIC	Kano
Francesco Giotta	Technical Advisor	NOIC	Kano
Maryam Abdul-Razak	Peace Builder	NOIC	Kano
Ibrahim Bawa	Training Manager	NOIC	Kano
Musbahu Badawi	Micro-credit Specialist	NOIC	Kano
Amina Dantiye	HIV/AIDS instructor	NOIC	Kano
Nafisa Ado	Counselor	NOIC	Kano
Umar Bala Mohamed	Job Developer	NOIC	Kano
Mahmud Idriss			
Abdullah	Peace Builder	NOIC	Kano
Garba Ado	HIV/AIDS instructor	NOIC	Kano
Alhadji M. Lamido	Chairman	Program Advisory Board	Kano
Maimuna Sani	Member	Program Advisory Board	Kano
Bolu Omole Ohonsi	Micro-credit Coordinator	NOIC	Kano
Ayuba Ali Baba	Coops Officer	NOIC	Kano
Jennifer E. John	Coops Officer	NOIC	Kano
Salisu Shehu Salihi	Vocational Specialist	NOIC	Kano

Hamzat Mani			
Yangora	Vice Principal	Government Technical College	Kano
Safiya Datti	Principal	City Women's Center	Kano
Aishato Abdu Barki	Vocational Education	City Women's Center	Kano
A. Murtala Ahmed	Vice Principal	City Women's Center	Kano
T. Hama	Training Officer	City Women's Center	Kano
Officials	Business Incubation Center		Kano
Kankausa	Women's cooperative		Kano

Appendix 4: List of Documents Consulted

Adam, S. and Kunert, A. (2002) *Employment-Oriented Private Sector Development Programme (EoPSD). Assessments of Private Sector in Nassarawa and Niger States. (GTZ)*

Jegede, F., 2001. *Workforce Development and Civil Society Strengthening Initiative Baseline Survey*. Vol. 1 and 2. OICI/USAID.

OICI/NOIC, 2001. *Workforce Development and Civil Society Strengthening Initiative*. First Quarterly Progress Report. March–June.

OICI/NOIC, 2001. *Workforce Development and Civil Society Strengthening Initiative*. Second Quarterly Progress Report. July 1–October 31.

OICI/NOIC, 2002. *Workforce Development and Civil Society Strengthening Initiative*. Third Quarterly Report. November 1–December 31.

OICI/NOIC, 2002. *Workforce Development and Civil Society Strengthening Initiative*. Fourth Quarterly Report. January 1, 2002–March 31.

OICI/NOIC, 2002. *Workforce Development and Civil Society Strengthening Initiative*. Fifth Quarterly Report./Performance Indicators. Draft.

USAID/Nigeria, 2002. *FY 2002 Annual Report*.

USAID/Nigeria, 2002. *Literacy Enhancement Assistance Program (LEAP)*.

USAID/OICI, 2001. *Award No. 620-A-00-01-00003*. Cooperative Agreement.

USAID/The Center for Human Capacity Development, 1998. *Investing in Tomorrow's Workforce: India, Namibia, Peru, Philippines, Tanzania*. Newton, MA: The Center for Workforce Development, Inc.

Appendix 5: Scope of Work of the Evaluation

YOUTH WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT IN NIGERIA: ASSESSMENT AND SITUATION ANALYSIS

Scope of Work

I. Background

Years of neglect and deterioration within the Nigerian educational system have taken their toll on the ability of youths to serve as productive members of society. Without job skills, many Nigerian youths turn to crime, making the country unattractive to investors, thus perpetuating a vicious cycle. Moreover, unemployed “angry young men” are often enlisted by political parties to intimidate and harass other political parties, sometimes leading to violent confrontations that destabilize the democratic process. Unemployed youth are also often drafted into para-militia organizations, such as the Oduduwa People’s Congress (OPC) in the Southwest and the Bakassi Boys in the Niger Delta region. These types of militia have been known to destabilize local and state government authorities, and have contributed to ethnic conflict throughout the country. The recent riots in Kano (October 2001) were fueled in part by unemployed youth who took the opportunity of a peaceful demonstration in protest of the war in Afghanistan, to loot markets and vent their anger in opportunistic acts of violence. To help break this cycle, since early 2001 USAID/Nigeria has made modest investments in youth workforce development, combined with other efforts to improve the performance of Nigeria’s economy as a whole.

Population and geography: With a population currently estimated at 120 million, Nigeria is the most populous country in sub-Saharan Africa. Northern Nigeria differs from southern Nigeria along distinctive lines. The North is predominantly Muslim, the economy based almost entirely on agriculture, the terrain is savanna (or sahel), and the climate is dry. The South is characterized by large urban cities (such as Lagos, inhabited by over 10 million people), the oil-rich Niger Delta region, and the remains of what was once a vast tropical rainforest. Nigeria is divided almost equally between Muslims and Christians, and has over 250 ethnic groups -- the largest being the Hausa (north), the Yoruba (southwest), and the Igbo (southeast). The population is increasing at a rate of about 3% annually, and about half the population is below 15 years of age.

Political Context: A former British colony, Nigeria gained its independence in 1960. Since then, Nigeria has been governed by democratically-elected civilian governments for a total of only about twelve years. Under the various military regimes in power for much of the 1980s and 1990s, living conditions deteriorated drastically and the development of community-based civic institutions was hindered. In late 1998, elections were held nationally, resulting in the election of Olusegun Obasanjo, as Nigeria’s first democratically elected president in 20 years. Given high levels of unemployment, limited educational and job opportunities, widespread corruption, ethnic and civil conflicts, and poor infrastructure, Nigeria currently poses many challenges for the present government.

Economic Conditions: Over the past decade, the Nigerian economy has been stagnant, but over the past few years has just been able to keep up with population growth. Poor infrastructure and the lack of a maintenance culture have resulted in businesses operating far below their capacity. Inflation, which by the end of 1999 was virtually zero, recently climbed back to nearly 20% per annum. Nigeria is the world's sixth largest producer of petroleum products, with oil accounting for 90% of Nigeria's exports and 80% of its foreign earnings -- effectively creating a mono-economy. Oil has proven to be both a blessing and a curse for Nigerians. While it has kept the nation afloat for almost four decades, it also has hindered production and development in other sectors (agriculture, in particular), and has directly contributed to conflicts in the Niger Delta and, indirectly, in other regions of Nigeria as well. In sum, Nigeria ranks as one of the poorest countries in the world and, according to a Private Sector Assessment financed recently by USAID and the World Bank, it is also one of the most difficult places in the world to do business.

Labor Market and Unemployment: The average income in Nigeria is very low (US\$300-\$350 in 2000), with the number of people living below the poverty line estimated at 60-70%. Opportunities for formal-sector jobs are contracting, and 60% of Nigeria's workforce is employed in the informal sector. Of the estimated 100,000 graduates from Nigerian universities each year, only 10% are expected to find employment in the formal sector. Statistics on employment and unemployment in Nigeria are neither always available nor up-to-date. According to the International Labor Organization, in 1990, most employment was found in the services sector (50.1%), followed by agriculture (43%), with only 6.9% employed in industry. Because Nigeria's population has grown at a much faster rate than jobs have been created, unemployment rates appear to be extremely high -- the official figure of around 5% is more realistically estimated to be as high as 28% (and 40% for urban youth). Unemployment appears to vary according to age and education level (gradually increasing each), and is highest among 15-24 year olds, and with secondary school leavers.

Education Sector: Nigeria's education system has experienced marked periods of expansion and decline over the past forty years. In the 1970s, Nigeria's education system was reputed to be the best in West Africa. Yet by the 1980s, and throughout the 1990s, economic decline coupled with military rule resulted in a prolonged period of neglect and decay in the education system. Currently, the Nigerian education system is unable to provide adequate sector financing, service delivery, or staff development and training. Consequently, learner outcomes and the overall provision of quality basic education and opportunities for further education have been undermined. The current government of Nigeria has pledged to make education a priority for national development, though education's share of the federal budget is yet to top 10%, and is one of the lowest in sub-Saharan Africa. Nigeria's overall literacy rate is 53% and is as low as 40% for Primary 4 student graduates.

II. USAID/Nigeria's Education Program

The long-term objectives of improving access, quality and equity in Nigeria's education system require that responsible public and civic organizations be reformed. Therefore, in collaboration with the Government of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, USAID/Nigeria's Strategic Objective 3 is to 'Develop the Foundation for Education Reform'. Currently, the USAID/Nigeria education program is part of a Mission-wide transitional strategy which will end in December 2003. It is expected that the successes, experiences, and lessons learned from this transitional period will inform a longer-term education sector support program. Work on a new five-year strategy will begin later this year.

USAID's education program is focused on addressing educational improvement at the primary education level and on providing income generating opportunities for out of school youth who are beyond the primary level. The two components of our program follow.

A. Literacy Enhancement Assistance Program

The bulk of USAID/Nigeria's education program is focused on a primary school improvement program, called LEAP (Literacy Enhancement Assistance Program). LEAP is a \$10.7 million, 2 year program which includes the following components: teacher training based on Interactive Radio Instruction (IRI); the development of literacy/numeracy agendas at school, local government and state levels; incentive grants to foster community participation in schools; improved collection and use of school-based data; and activities in support of the professionalization of teachers. LEAP is operational in Kano, Lagos, and Nasarawa States, and began implementation in November 2001 under a cooperative agreement with the Education Development Center.

Youth Workforce Development Program

Prior to LEAP, in January 2001 USAID/Nigeria awarded Opportunities Industrialisation Centres International a two-year, \$2.88 million cooperative agreement for the implementation of the Workforce Development and Civil Society Strengthening Initiative (WDCSSI). This cooperative agreement resulted from the submission of an unsolicited proposal during the development of USAID's first education program in Nigeria in almost 30 years.

OICI is implementing WDCSSI through its Nigerian affiliate, Nigeria Opportunities Industrialisation Centres (NOIC), with the assistance of two U.S. OICI Technical Advisors (one based in Kano and the other in Lagos, who is responsible for both the Lagos and Delta programs). NOIC is a locally registered NGO and was founded in 1970. Early in its establishment, NOIC received funding from USAID and at various other times has received other donor funds, but for the most part NOIC has continued operation through the intervening 30 years through charging school fees. NOIC operates centers in Lagos, Delta, Ekiti and Edo States, and has a youth-training program in Port Harcourt, Rivers State.

WDCSSI, however, is operational only in the following three states: Delta, Kano and Lagos. In Lagos and Delta, it works through the established NOIC centers, but in Kano, it is assisting existing state, federal and private vocational training schools. Approximately 50% of project funds are targeted at Kano State, with the remainder divided between Lagos and Delta. WDCSSI aims to assist the people and government of Nigeria in addressing challenges concerning workforce development, job creation, NGO strengthening, conflict resolution, and private sector economic development. Specifically, it is striving to:

- strengthen existing vocation skills training institutions;
- create dialogue between training institutions and trade/industry sectors to assess the market and determine training needs;
- upgrade vocational skills curricula and instruction; and
- train individuals in basic skills (HIV/AIDS and conflict mitigation) needed to improve the quality of their lives and to strengthen civil society.

OICI's initiative in youth workforce development contributes to USAID/Nigeria's Strategic Objective 3 the following key areas: setting a model for reformed vocational education (i.e., one that is market driven); and, including 'life skills', such as 'peace studies'/conflict mitigation and HIV/AIDS awareness and prevention, as part of technical skills training.

While OICI was granted funds for the implementation of WDCSSI at the end of January 2001, on-the-ground implementation only began in April due to delays in funds disbursement. The first year of implementation of the project has also seen a number of other delays in:

- recruitment of the Lagos/Delta Advisor;
- recruitment of local hire staff (Lagos and Delta, in particular);
- infrastructure building and procurement of equipment (Lagos and Delta);
- completion of a comprehensive baseline survey;
- curricula revision/development "to increase the relevance of technical skills training to market needs in Kano, Lagos, and Delta States" – WDCSSI's primary objective;
- curricula development for modules on 'peace studies'/conflict mitigation and HIV/AIDS;
- provision of income-generation/micro-credit opportunities (Kano); and
- responding to administrative requests made by USAID.

At the same time as OICI was experiencing the above-mentioned implementation problems, USAID/Nigeria has been undergoing an intensive period of strategic planning. Through this, it has become apparent that elements of WDCSSI do not fit easily into the Mission's objective to 'develop the foundation of education reform' (for example, NGO strengthening). Nonetheless, USAID/Nigeria remains committed to continuing our work

in youth workforce development. Clearly, Nigeria also continues to be in need of sustained donor assistance in this area.

III. Goal, Objectives and Tasks

GOAL

The overall goal of this contract is to assess the impact of USAID/Nigeria's current investment in, and assistance to, workforce development, as well as to provide an analysis of the sector, which will potentially guide future USAID/Nigeria investments in the sector.

OBJECTIVES

There are two interconnected objectives to this scope of work. First, is to conduct an **evaluation of WDCSSI** to date, providing input on how to maximize results over the remainder of USAID funding to OICI (expected to end in April 2003), and helping OICI/NOIC to address issues of sustainability -- particularly for the Kano program. Second, is to provide USAID/Nigeria with a **comprehensive situation analysis of youth workforce development in Nigeria**, but focusing on Lagos, Delta, and Kano States (and making recommendations concerning a fourth intervention state, currently designated as Kaduna). As stated above, USAID/Nigeria will soon begin the design of a new 5-year strategy. To do this effectively for our activities in youth workforce development, up-to-date and reliable data and analysis on the sector will be crucial. Included should be recommendations on how to expand on the work we have already done through OICI/NOIC and/or how otherwise USAID/Nigeria can best make an impact in youth workforce development in Nigeria.

TASKS

A. Evaluation

In conducting the evaluation of WDCSSI, the contractor will provide a report (no more than 30 pages) that results from and makes recommendations for:

1. Assessing the performance and impact of WDCSSI by state (Delta, Kano and Lagos) based on targets established in the cooperative agreement, and thereafter agreed upon by USAID/Nigeria
2. Analyzing the effectiveness of the approach being used in Kano vis-a-vis that in Delta and Lagos;
3. Reviewing OICI's baseline survey and determining the extent of its impact;
4. Appraising curriculum modules developed for 'peace studies'/conflict mitigation and HIV/AIDS, as well as the on-going instruction of these courses;
5. Assessing the status of curriculum improvement for vocational training courses;
6. Determining the appropriateness of infrastructure built, and equipment procured, with USAID funding;

7. Evaluating the status and performance of the Kano micro-credit program;
8. Reviewing the suitability of WDCSSI staffing (quantity and quality);
9. Exploring the role of NOIC's National Board of Directors and regional advisory boards;
10. Addressing sustainability of activities post-USAID funding (particularly for Kano);
11. Exploring OICI/NOIC efforts at coordination with State and Federal stakeholders (individuals and organizations);
12. Assessing the support provided to the project by OICI headquarters (both technical and administrative); and,
13. Identifying key activities and corrective actions that should be undertaken during the remainder of WDCSSI.

B. Situation Analysis

The contractor will produce a second report based on the information generated by a situation analysis (again, no more than 30 pages) that results from, and again makes recommendations for:

1. An overview of the current status of youth (15 to 30 year olds) in Nigeria in general, and in more depth in the 4 focus states (Delta, Lagos, Kano and tentatively Kaduna);
2. Analyzing existing employment roadblocks and potential opportunities;
3. Exploring skills training opportunities, job development, and employment services available for youth;
4. Compiling information on government (state and federal), donor, and - to some extent private (i.e., Shell, Chevron, etc.) programs and actions in the sector;
5. Creating a bibliography of relevant data on youth workforce development in Nigeria, identifying critical gaps; and
6. Examining state-of-the-art youth workforce development interventions that have demonstrated measurable impact in other countries in Africa and the world.

Based on the results that emerge from both of these activities, 'lessons learned' should be outlined and recommendations made for future USAID/Nigeria interventions in youth workforce development (to be incorporated in the second report).

IV. Methodology

The approach to be developed under this Scope of Work should be strategic, participatory in gathering information, fairly low-cost, quick to implement, and practical in its recommendations.

A. Evaluation

USAID looks to the contractor to develop the appropriate methods for information gathering and analysis, but for the evaluation of WDCSSI should include:

- Review of documents (OICI proposal and attachments, quarterly reports, Annual Portfolio Review, Performance Monitoring Plan, Annual Report, etc.);
- Site visits to Lagos, Delta, Kano;
- Interviews or focus groups with:
 - A. Key USAID/Nigeria staff;
 - B. Select OICI/NOIC staff, board members, trainers and trainees;
 - C. OICI/NOIC partners: government (state and federal), NGOs, employers, and other vocational training schools.

B. Situation Analysis

For the situation analysis of youth workforce development, the methodology should include:

- Collection and review of documents – in-country, from government, donors, and implementing agencies; and out of country, from USAID/W and other donors via the internet or by requesting information from their headquarters, and from other Missions possibly by way of an e-mail inquiry;
- Site visits to Lagos, Delta, Kano, and tentatively Kaduna – to be coordinated with the evaluation of WDCSSI;
- Interviews or focus groups with:
 1. Key government actors (National Directorate of Employment, in particular) at the federal and state levels;
 2. Donor and implementing agencies involved in the sector (ILO, GTZ, IFESH, and the Youth Movement of Nigeria, for example);
 3. USAID/W Human Capacity Development staff responsible for workforce development;
 4. OICI/NOIC and their partners: government (state and federal), NGOs, employers, and other vocational training schools – to be coordinated with the evaluation of WDCSSI.

V. SCHEDULE

An eight-week period is proposed for this scope of work, including travel days to and from the US for US-based staff. Six-day workweeks are requested.

First Week: 19 - 22 June, 2002

- Consultation with workforce development specialists from AID/Washington Human Capacity Development Center and the Africa Bureau's Office of Sustainable Development, and possibly with OICI headquarters staff (Philadelphia).
- Travel to Abuja for US-based staff.

Second Week: 24 – 29 June, 2002

- Formation of full team in-country.
- Initial planning meeting with USAID/Nigeria.
- Background document collection and review.
- Interviews with Nigerian government (National Directorate of Employment), and Abuja-based donors and implementing agencies.
- Travel to Delta State.

Third Week: 1 – 6 July, 2002

- Site visit to NOIC-Delta and data collection in the state..
- Travel to Lagos.

Fourth Week: 8 – 13 July, 2002

- Site visit to NOIC-Lagos and data collection in the state.
- Travel to Kano State.
- Site visit to NOIC-Kano and data collection in the state.

Fifth Week: 15 – 20 July, 2002

- One team: Return to Abuja and begin report writing.
- Second Team: Travel to Kaduna State to conduct data collection.
- Full team return to Abuja

Sixth and Seventh Week: 22 – 30 July, 2002

- Report writing.
- Conduct de-briefing for Mission on site visits and initial findings.
- Submission of first draft of both reports and debriefing for Mission.
- Departure of US-based staff.

Seventh and Eighth Week: 31 July – 13 August, 2002

- Mission prepares and submits comments on drafts.
- US-based staff incorporate USAID/Nigeria input and finalize reports.

VI. Team Composition and Qualifications

Team Leader (US): The Team Leader will be responsible for the overall organization of the two reports and the various presentations, and will take the lead on one of the reports. S/he will be the chief liaison with USAID/Nigeria and will provide guidance and oversight for the other team members, assigning tasks among them, and will ensure the timely completion of tasks as well as the final two reports to be delivered. The Team Leader should have extensive experience in leadership and a strong technical background in workforce development/vocational education (a minimum of 10 years, preferably in developing countries). Previous experience in conducting evaluations and situation analyses is a prerequisite for this position, as are excellent writing and editing skills. The Team Leader must be able to provide technical as well as administrative leadership and management to the team. S/he should have experience and understanding of USAID systems and procedures, and should consult with USAID/Nigeria regularly throughout this exercise to ensure progress is sound and key issues are being addressed.

Employment Specialist (US): The Employment Specialist must be trained at the graduate level in economics, with an emphasis on the labor market and employment issues and trends. S/he will take the lead in one of the two reports, and therefore should have excellent writing and organizational skills. The Employment Specialist should have extensive experience in small and medium enterprise development, and with micro-credit lending programs that support this end (preferably in developing countries, and in excess of five years). Analytical skills will be essential, as will be understanding of, and experience with, USAID evaluation and monitoring norms.

Education Advisor (AID/W): To be determined.

Educator (Nigerian): The Educator will need to have a detailed understanding of the Nigerian vocational education sector to give quantitative and qualitative input to both reports. S/he must also have knowledge of the main stakeholders and actors in the sector; be able to explain the range and breadth of government, donor and public/private organization support; and also be able to guide the team to determine who it should meet with, and for what purpose, in Delta, Lagos, Kano and Kaduna States. Excellent writing skills will be required, as the Educator is expected to contribute to both reports.

Economist (Nigerian): The Economist should be trained at the graduate level in economics, preferably with emphasis on the labor market. S/he will need to be able to provide the team with background on Nigerian local (state) and macro-economic conditions, as well as identify key influencers (individuals, organizations and environmental systems) on labor market issues and assess and describe their importance. S/he should be able to guide the team to determine with whom it should meet with in

Delta, Lagos, Kano and Kaduna States. Excellent analytical and writing skills will be required, as the Economist is expected to assist with assessments led by the Employment Specialist.

VII. Deliverables

Two reports, each no more than 30 pages in length, as described under **Section III** above, shall be the primary deliverables. The reports will be submitted in a manner that is conducive to assisting Mission managers and decision-makers to provide continued support to the WDCSSI activity, while at the same time enabling them to begin the development of the Missions new 5-year Education Strategy. At minimum, each report should include the following: an executive summary, background and introduction, findings, issues, lessons learned, conclusions/recommendations and suggestions for future directions, as well as annexes to include a list of contacts and reference documents. For the evaluation, the Mission will require one electronic copy, and three hard copies. For the situation analysis, 100 bound copies (and 1 electronic) will be required.

A debriefing for the Mission shall be provided upon completion of the draft report that will highlight the major findings and recommendations of both reports. Mission input will be incorporated into the final documents.

IX. USAID's Role

The team will work under the direction of the General Development Office, Education Office. The General Development Officer, or the Mission Director, will assign a USAID/Nigeria point person for this activity.

AMENDMENT TO STATEMENT OF WORK OF APRIL 15, 2002

The contractor is to provide a review of the work performed by the International Foundation for Education Self-Help (IFESH) and Opportunities Industrialisation Centres International (OICI) in the Delta area. The review is to comprise of a matrix of the types of activities for each organization, the populations they each serve, their programs' funding sources by percentage and the synergies between their two programs as well as their distinctions. The contractor is also to discuss with IFESH, their perspective on youth unemployment issues in the Delta and other related issues that cause the difficult situation found in that portion of the country.

X. Attachments:

- OICI WDCSSI Proposal
- WDCSSI Quarterly Reports (#1 – 4)
- WDCSSI Baseline Survey Report
- NOIC Brochure
- 2001 Annual Program Review (USAID/Nigeria)
- FY2002 Annual Report (USAID/Nigeria)
- SO3 Education Brief (USAID/Nigeria)
- LEAP Brief (USAID/Nigeria)

Appendix 6: OICI Response



OPPORTUNITIES INDUSTRIALIZATION CENTERS INTERNATIONAL
Transforming hopelessness to hope through human resource development

October 15, 2002

Melinda Taylor, Education Specialist
USAID Technical Officer Strategic Objective 3
Metro Plaza, Plot 992, Fourth Avenue
Abuja, Nigeria

RE: OICI Response to the WDCSSI Evaluation Report

Dear Melinda:

We have sent copies of TMG's Evaluation Report to our partners, and have had the opportunity to review thoroughly the findings, interpretations and recommendations contained therein. OICI and NOIC concur with most of the major findings of the Report, and consider the Evaluation fair and professionally done. However, we also feel it is important to challenge several findings and analytical observations found in the Report, as it is to learn from our mistakes and build on WDCSSI's foundation in our forthcoming Revised Extension Request to USAID. We have organized our responses as follows: in Part I, we summarize the global findings with which we agree; in Part II we will summarize those findings and recommendations with which we do not agree; and in Part III we provide an outline how we plan to redress some of the project's shortcomings by providing a strategy to improve WDCSSI implementation

PART I: Evaluation findings with which we concur

- Project start-up delays hurt WDCSSI's implementation

This is an obvious but critical finding; our only comment here is to emphasize that the original 5 year project plan was compromised by a 24 month timeframe, a decision which resulted in initial indicators far too ambitious for a 2 year project.

- WDCSSI's completion date should be extended through the end of the Nigeria 2003 Academic Year.

We agree with the notion that the time frame for WDCSSI must be extended. This is a major consideration in our forthcoming Extension Request proposal to USAID, but we do not necessarily agree that the end of the Nigerian Academic year is the only possible time frame to be adopted.

- Progress has been made in upgrading NOIC infrastructure, in staffing, in promoting HIV/AIDS and Peace Building education at all sites, in defining roles and responsibilities for various stakeholders and actors (National Secretariat, National Board, local PACs, program managers, OICI Resident Advisors), in reporting on WDCSSI, in revising/changing/adding selected curricula (Lagos), in beginning to promote employer partnerships, and in beginning the CBE training for all NOIC (and partner) staff.
- Under Objective #3, TOT activities for staff at other vocational institutions should be dropped.

PART II: Evaluation findings and recommendations with which we do not concur

- Future capacity-building activities under Objective #2 should be dropped

OICI is a capacity-building organization, and it is difficult to accept TMG recommendation's implication that Objective 2 is not fundamental to WDCSSI's original design. But we accept the recommendation's practical judgment of prioritizing activities under Objective 1. With hindsight, we can now see how certain features of the proposal were intended at the design phase. For example, a critical design lapse appeared to be the seemingly weak connection between the major workforce development objective (Objective #1) and Objective #2, which dealt with capacity-building for local organizations (NGOs and cooperatives). The original intent of this objective was to assist local producers in Kano, who were grouped informally by the desire to sell their products, to become more formal organizations (with a President, Treasurer, and bylaws) for the purpose of having greater market access and to improve sales and income. Hence the original idea for capacity-building was to promote the self-employment and income levels of these informal groups—a direct link to workforce development.

- OICI is the “real implementer of WDCSSI”

This is not the way OICI as an institution works, nor is it the case for WDCSSI. NOIC is the “real implementer” of the project; OICI as the grantee is *responsible for*

implementation vis-à-vis USAID, but we work through our affiliate NOIC (and only through our affiliate) to achieve the objectives of the project.¹

- “The figures given for enrollment [in the Lagos Program] ...771...seem to reflect a decline...”

In fact, the Lagos program has improved dramatically since the project’s beginning (from 421 documented in WDCSSI’s second progress report for the period July 1-October 31, 2001 to 771);

- “...because of the lack of a sound initial assessment of the socio-cultural environment and capacity of NOIC. This needs assessment should have been conducted by OICI before the proposal.”

OICI did indeed conduct a needs assessment of NOIC capacity and in several parts of the proposal mentioned that NOIC would require technical assistance to carry out the activities of WDCSSI.

PART III: Conclusions

OICI and NOIC accept the major findings of this Report, whose recommendations coincide with our won priorities for improving WDCSSI. In order to build on WDCSSI’s foundations and extend areas of impact, OICI will be submitting an Extension Request proposal whose basic strategic elements will be as follows:

1. Objective #1 (Workforce Development)

- accelerate and re-enforce CBE for all NOIC staff
- activate/obtain feedback for curricula from Employers Fora at all sites (CBE)
- revise/update/modify/change all vocational skills curricula²
- provide entrepreneurship training for all sites

2. Objective #2 (Capacity-Building for NGOs)

- transform credit fund into a grant to NOIC
- build NOIC Kano’s capacity to manage the microcredit program

3. Objective #3: HIV/AIDS/Peace-Building

¹ A distinction which is made clear in our proposal, p. 30: “...National Secretariat staff members will be responsible for implementing and monitoring most of the activities described in this proposal.”

² Using implications from Baseline Survey and feedback from Employers Fora

- Finalize revisions to all HIV/AIDS and Peace-Building curricula

4. NOIC Sustainability

- launch income-generating projects for Lagos and Delta
- follow-up to Kano Microcredit program

These elements will structure the new work plan and budget for our Extension Request, and it is our hope that with USAID support we will achieve the kind of impact which inspired WDCSSI's design.

Sincerely,

Jeffrey L. Gray
Vice President

cc: The Mitchell Group, Inc.
1816 11th Street N.W.
Washington, DC 20001

Appendix 7: TMG CONSULTANTS' RESPONSE TO NOIC'S AND OICI FEEDBACK ON THE EVALUATION OF THE WDSSCI

We would like to thank OICI and NOIC for their feedback on our evaluation. We are glad to note that OICI and NOIC concur with most of the findings and that they find the evaluation “fair and professional” on the whole.

We recognize the importance of challenging some of the findings. However, we would like to stress that in undertaking this evaluation, our prime concern was to be fair and have a comprehensive appreciation of the different stakeholders (OICI, NOIC's management, staff, National Secretariat, instructors, trainees and the different partners) within the specific framework of our assignment. We have tried as much as possible to look at the WDSSCI using all these stakeholders' lenses. In addition, the evaluation was done at a specific time and with specific amount of data available within this timeframe. For example: some information on activities such as lectures given by employers after the Employers Forum in Lagos was not brought to our knowledge.

We would also like to touch on specific issues raised by OICI and NOIC:

1. “Formal assessment” as used in the report, is to be understood as “site-specific, including the different stakeholders at each site”. It is used in reference to the process leading to the design of the project and the breaking down of the baseline survey findings. This is what did not appear to have been done in Warri (Delta) especially for the findings of the baseline survey.
2. The suggestion to drop Objective # 2 does not imply that the objective in itself is irrelevant. It simply means that pressed by time and the need to show results, it is desirable to prioritize actions in the WDSSCI. Disengaging from areas with more challenges and focusing on those that are already bearing fruits seems strategically more adequate.
3. It is important that the CBE workshops at each site are more in-depth and include the teaching staff. In the same vein, even if the design of the vocational curricula has to be overseen by the curriculum development unit in Lagos, it would be advisable to have input from instructors and employers of Delta.

We commend OICI and NOIC for the actions that have been designed as a result of our evaluation. We would like to draw attention to the elements of sustainability and impact in a project as outlined in our report and engage them to work more on fostering ownership.

We have made two corrections to the report:

- On page 2: the number of NGO is 39 instead of 19. However, we have kept “53 participants” as it is the figure stated in the Fourth WDSSCI Quarterly Progress Report.
- We have also corrected the title of the National Executive Director.